

MINUTES

Committee of the Whole Meeting
May 15, 2020
9:30 a m = 11:30 a m

9:30 a.m. – 11:30 a.m. Virtual Webex Meeting

Greenville Transit Authority

<u>Attending</u>

Board Members: Ms. Addy Matney (Treasurer), Mr. David Mitchell, Mr. Dick O'Neill (Chairman),

Mr. Darren Scott, Ms. Amanda Warren (Vice Chair)

Absent Board Members:

Mr. George Campbell, Ms. Inez Morris

City Staff in Attendance:

Others in Attendance:

Karen Crawford (Comptroller), Jasmin Curtis (Safety and Training Officer),

Matt Efird (Director OMB/Budget), James Keel (Transit Director),

Nicole McAden (Marketing & Public Affairs Manager), Jason Sanders (Fleet Manager),

Kayleigh Sullivan (Transit Planning Manager)

Amy Connor (Public), Anthony Lewis (Public), Stephen Shelato (United Ministries)

Mr. Dick O'Neill, Board Chair, called the meeting to order at approximately 9:30 a.m.

A quorum established via roll call.

Public Comments Related to Proposed Changes to Route 504 (Anderson Rd.), Route 501 (Pleasantburg Dr.) and Route 507 (Augusta Rd.):

Amy Connor (New Horizon Family Health Center) - New Horizon serves about 20,000 patients in the Upstate. Bus stop in front of the office on West Farris Road was removed from service with the July 2019 changes. Patients with health issues struggle to cross the busy four lanes of Farris Road. The proposed changes return service to the stop in front of New Horizon, this stop is important for New Horizon patients.

Anthony Lewis – Mr. Lewis is concerned about the distance between the bus stops. When the bus leaves the terminal and comes down Anderson Road there is a bus stop at United Ministries, but the next bus stop is a mile away. The bus stop at Dunbar and Jenkins was removed. Mr. Lewis would like to see a stop in front of the Flea Market on White Horse Road.

Quality of Service – (Safety & Operations Manager Jasmin Curtis): On time performance from March to April increased by 17%. 88% of all trips were on-time, 6% were late, and 6% were early. We are still struggling with 601 due to its connection with 510. We had 2 missed trips. Greenlink's existing operations are fully staffed so we can focus on TDP later-hours operator vacancies. We have 2 operators in the hiring process and 2 interviews scheduled for next week. We had 2 unfounded complaints and no reportable accidents. GAP average trip length went from 20 to 16 minutes with less trips and traffic. GAP on-time performance was100%. In April we limited our passenger capacity to 10 passengers per fixed route bus as a result of COVID-19. Therefore, we missed 899 passengers (35 per day) that we could not transfer due to COVID-19 bus capacity restrictions. When paratransit experienced slow reservations, drivers were instructed to follow fixed route buses to pick up additional passengers. We will ease restrictions to 15 passengers per bus on Monday, May 18.

Reliability of Service – (Fleet Manager Jason Sanders): We had a total of 7 road calls with 1 being a major road call. Major Service call interruptions are down. We have been trending down for the last 5 months. Reliability for each vehicle is high due to mid-life overhauls being completed on each vehicle. We still had one vehicle at Coach Crafters being overhauled in April.

Quantity of Service – (*Transit Planning Manager Kayleigh Sullivan*): Ridership is down. TouchPass usage was 0 since operated zero fare policy in April. No trolley service in April. Total ridership in April 2020 was down by around 43% compared to April 2019. Miles and hours are down slightly. No Clemson ID usage. We GAP total ridership was 352 in April. We plan to relaunch trolley service June 4.

Marketing Report – (Marketing & Public Affairs Manager Nicole McAden): No new advertising contracts since most advertising plans have been put on hold due to COVID-19. Through April we have received \$61,863.58 in advertising revenue.

- PR/Media Coverage: COVID-19 coverage. Our proposed route changes were covered.
- Partnerships: Phone call with the United Way who is looking to get people to non-profits and human service providers for COVID-19 assistance. Two fare free days have been cancelled.
- Events/Tours: Presentation to Reedy River Rotary Club over Zoom. Hosted Touch a Truck on Facebook Live. GPATS Study team met at end of April to discuss human trafficking grant and adding it into the TIP program for the FTA.



56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63 64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80 81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88 89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

101

102

103104

105

106

107

108

109 110

111

112

MINUTES

City's Monthly Financial Reports for March – (Matt Efird OMB Director,): A/R balance was \$620,664.63 at the end of March. Of this \$352,000 has been received through last week. We have around \$600 in outstanding advertising invoices. A/P at end of March was \$783,000. Everything has been paid except the \$141,000 owed to the FTA as of May 7. YTD numbers are down significantly due to decreased ridership and routes being fare free due to COVID-19. Expenses tracking similar to last year. We had an increase in operating expenses due to extra sanitizing and other supplies purchased for COVID-19. Non-operating revenue is a little higher since contributions from the City and County were deposited. Net position increased significantly from where we were last year due to capital influx.

Discussion of Transfer Fare Analysis – (Marketing & Public Affairs Manager Nicole McAden): Peer comparisons against eight peer agencies analyzed in COA and TDP. Charlotte charges flat rate which means fare is a \$1.00 for a ride and \$1.00 for a transfer. Baton Rouge fare is \$1.75 and transfer is 25 cents. Charleston charges \$2.00 and transfers are free. Chattanooga fare is \$1.50 and they do not sell transfer tickets, so another \$1.50 would be charged. Columbia fare is \$2.00 with a free transfer ticket. Greensboro fare is \$1.50with a free transfer. Mobile charges \$1.25 with 10 cent transfer. Winston-Salem charges total fare of \$1.00. Our total fare average is \$2.00. If Greenlink offered free transfers, our total fare received would only be \$1.50. Greenlink's projected FY20 revenue before COVID-19 was \$510,000 this fiscal year. If Greenlink implemented a flat fare structure of \$1.00 for each trip (no transfers tickets), we could lose \$96,000 in fare revenue. However, we would see reduced farebox maintenance costs because the fare boxes would not get jammed with transfer tickets. If we implemented a fare policy that provided free transfers, keeping the \$1.50 for full adult fare, \$0.75 for reduced fare and \$1.25 for students and youth, we could lose transfer revenue totaling about \$75,000. We may see a decrease in single trip revenue because there would be an incentive to as for free transfers that they have no intention of using. Staff then looked at increasing single trip fares, with free transfers, so that Greenlink has the potential to recoup the same amount received now with the single trip + transfers. We would come out about revenue neutral, ahead by \$6,000. However, by increasing fares, we are going to decrease ridership. The standard industry equation for every 10% increase in fares, you see a 3% decrease in ridership.

Proposed Route Changes Evaluation Criteria – (Transit Planning Manager Kayleigh Sullivan): This is a preliminary summary of on-going evaluations, as we are still receiving public comment through May 19. With route 504, we currently have 1 vehicle, 60 minute frequency and 43 stops. It has some bi-directionality on Anderson Rd and Whitehorse Rd. Total ridership since July 1 is almost 60,000. Since we started this route, it has consistently been our number 2 performing route in terms of ridership. To date this route has only been on-time 42% of the time. On-time performance was looked at before the policy change allowing for on-time departures. Before the change, we were on-time only about 30%. After the change, our on time performance shot up to almost 54%. Staff first brought this to the Board because it was affecting the reliability of our entire system. The highest stop used for boarding and alighting is the ER entrance of the hospital. Initially, we came up with 2 different solutions and recommended a final solution regarding potential on-time departure policy change. The Board moved forward with the policy change. We have since developed 2 additional options for public comment. About 58% of the total stops for this route are along a bi-directional corridor; the outbound stops account for the majority of our total boardings along the corridor and 30% of totals for the entire route. The inbound stops account for about 23% of the totals for the entire route. Option 1 goes down Mills Avenue and eliminates bi-directionality along Anderson Rd and Whitehorse Rd. Option 2 keeps about half of bi-directionality on Anderson Rd and goes through the Dunean neighborhood. With Option 1, United Ministries and the Julie Valentine Center would not have bi-directional service. There wouldn't be a stop on their side of the road but there would be a stop on the other side of the road. It has 41 stops based on the test run and took about 39 minutes. The benefit of Option 1 is it maintains a level of service on Anderson Road so we're not completely taking away service. It adds a very tiny amount of bi-directionality on Augusta Rd. You have access to a grocery store and direct access to the hospital and New Horizon. Option 2 maintains a little less than half bi-directionality along Anderson Road. It has 38 stops. The test run took about 43 minutes. Con is eliminating bi-directional service on the lower section of Anderson Road and service to Old Piedmont Highway. Both options are very comparable in terms of access to medical facilities and groceries. It boils down bi-directionality.

GTA priorities survey results show all Board Members agreed that job accessibility, on time performance, access to grocery stores and bi-directional service are the top four route priorities. If going strictly off the board priorities, our recommendation would be Option 2. Option 1 is likely to have more recovery time. Operations feels they can complete this on time. Drivers preferred Option 1 which is service to Mills Avenue. Ms. Curtis stated that from the Operators' perspective, they like the idea of putting more service back on Augusta and on Mills because they know the ridership likes to go there.

Ms. McAden stated to get public engagement we posted legal notices, news alerts, emails, fliers and mailings. Someone sent email wanting the bus to go back to the original route because people in Dunean are forced to find other transportation due to distance of current stops. Response numbers are low so we do not want these numbers to skew any decisions because



MINUTES

they're based on such a small population. Forty-eight people started taking the survey regarding 504. Half ride and half do not. Two respondents agreed that it needs to be changed. We had some requests to go back down Green Avenue and Dunean which is going to favor Option 2 with bi-directionality. We had comments supporting New Horizon and Roger C. Peace coming back on board. Participants were asked to rank the current route, Option 1 and Option 2. If they indicated they ride the bus, we asked them whether the route met their needs. Option 1 scored higher for both overall and existing riders. For Option 2, only two people answered that question. More people claim that Option 1 meets their needs and it scored highest on picking a final solution.

Ms. Sullivan stated that both routes provide service to New Horizon and direct access to the hospital. Mr. Keel stated next week staff will ask for a formal decision on 504. Prisma was not willing to foot the bill at 100% for a hospital shuttle but had some interest in potentially being a partner if we could find some federal money or other partners. Mr. Scott preferred having bi-directionality on White Horse Rd due to potential accidents. As we begin to ramp up extended hours, and this route being one of our top performers, accidents could become an issue. Chairman O'Neill stated he is leaning toward Option 1. Ms. Warren was leaning towards Option 2 because the stop at United Ministries both inbound and outbound is one of the stops with the highest number of people. Ms. Matney felt more input was needed from our ridership in order to help the Board make a decision. Mr. Keel stated we could put some type of comment box on the bus with comment cards. Ms. Sullivan stated phone and email feedback is better than that received in the past.

Relative to routes 501 and 507, Ms. Sullivan stated there is only one option staff is proposing to either route if the Board chooses to change it. She presented the current route 501. The downfall is that the BI-LO we were trying to get to by going down Mauldin Road has closed. There are no stops between the Greenville Tech area and Mauldin Road. We received a lot of calls and requests for access to Arcadia Hills and the Phoenix Center. Ridership on old Route 10 (Augusta) was 98,000 in FY2019 but dropped down to about 65,000 rides in the same timeframe for Route 507 (Augusta) is concerning. The proposed solution provides service back to Acadia Hills and the Phoenix Center on Route 501, but we would be required to cut out the part of the route that travels south to Pleasant Valley, and would instead have those stops served by Route 507. Staff received a lot of calls about this proposal. One individual was excited that she would now get served with this option. Another person was very happy with the option for Route 507. There was an individual that was concerned about Nicholtown being affected, but that neighborhood would not be affected. One individual did not like the proposal, because he currently lives at Augusta Heights and it would take him a longer to get to his bank. She received several emails from someone who was happy they got the opportunity to provide feedback. There was a person who agreed with their proposed change and an individual who really wanted us to add a bus stop back in from the Phoenix Center because of the medical and dental services provided in that area. Another individual strongly opposes this potential change because they need access to Greenlink more than Arcadia Hills or the Phoenix Center. Ms. McAden stated that once survey respondents had gone through the 504 questions and answered questions about 501, responses dropped down to 22 people. We are missing the numbers to really look at this. Looking at comments about 501, we had a supporter for Arcadia Hills request to return of service to that area. We had a comment from a survey taker who did not want the route change. We had a response requesting service to Alameda and Glen Road which is the old Route 1. We asked the respondents to score the current route and the proposed route. If you look at these alone, the proposed route was deemed better. None of the respondents indicated that they were existing riders. When asked which option the respondents prefers most, people chose the current route. We are not getting enough data to pick a clear winner. After respondents took survey for 504 and 501, respondents dropped down to 18 for the 507 questions. More responses came from people who don't ride. In terms of riders, one person indicated they like that they didn't have to come downtown to transfer routes. A person asked that we not change anything around the Farris Road area. A respondent was in favor of a change to the route overall. Respondents stated the current route meets their needs at a higher percentage. The 507 changes pick up the old 501 stops, so GTA can't change route 501 without changing 507.

Discussion of GTA Mission, Vision and Goals (GTA Chair Dick O'Neill): A lot of people equate the Greenville Transit Authority to Greenlink because we have not put GTA out there. This is an attempt to communicate that Greenlink operates under GTA. The document is a draft. Ms. Matney had one comment about the goal that highlights developing the downtown transit center. She suggested rewording it to say "maximizing our capital assets and property usage" and keep it a little bit more open ended. Chairman O'Neill asked Ms. Matney to reword this goal. He asked everybody to give thoughts before finalizing.

Approval of Board Invoices (Karen Crawford, City Comptroller):



MINUTES

| 4/30/20 | Proterra | Bus parts Total | 1016282 | \$489,182.04 |
|---------|---------------------|-----------------------------------|---------|--------------|
| 4/28/20 | Proterra | Bus parts | 1016173 | 189.22 |
| 4/28/20 | Noel Training | Phase 2 SMS Readiness assessment | 2021 | 8,150.00 |
| 4/22/20 | LinguaLinx | Translations for public documents | 86232 | 115.02 |
| 4/30/20 | Ivey Communications | Transit Center door upgrade | 22806 | 2,961.80 |
| 4/30/20 | Coach Crafters | Midlife overhaul of bus 403 | FL2413 | 16,059.48 |
| 4/30/20 | Coach Crafters | Midlife overhaul of bus 403 | FL2212 | 5,127.04 |
| 4/30/20 | Coach Crafters | Midlife overhaul of bus 403 | FL2211 | 39399.34 |
| 4/15/20 | Coach Crafters | Midlife overhaul of bus 402 | FL2246 | 2,486.79 |
| 4/3020 | City of Greenville | April 2020 expenses | | 414,051.79 |

Mr. Darren Scott made a motion to recommend payment of invoices totaling \$489,182.04. This is subject to the availability of funds. Ms. Addy Matney seconded the motion. There is no opposition. The motion carries.

Action Item: Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan – (Safety & Operations Manager Jasmin Curtis): The federal regulations 49 CFR part 673 grants FTA authority to set minimum safety standards for public transit agencies, set new standards for state safety oversight, and withhold federal funding for agencies that are in non-compliance. The final rule requires all transit agencies across the country to redevelop their agency safety plans to include a standardized system for monitoring and managing safety within the agency safety performance targets to use as a measure for safety performance based on established criteria and the FTA's National Public Transportation Safety Plan. Safety performance criteria is based on current reporting requirements for the National Transit Database (NTD). They require us to report on our reportable injuries, reportable safety events, fatalities and system reliability. The difference is primarily in documentation requirements. The Safety Management System is the process by which they want us to manage safety at an agency. Safety management policy defines the transit agency safety objectives, outlines roles and responsibilities within the organization relative to safety, and it places accountability to adhere to the plan and appropriately allocate resources with the highest accountable executive for the agency. The deadline for getting the plan adopted, certified and implemented is July 20, 2020. Before we can implement a new plan we have to get it certified by the state. Once the final rule became effective July 19, 2019, we got the process started and hired a consultant who was here to perform a readiness assessment in December 2019. Earlier this month, our agency safety plan was completed. We want to get final approval at the May Board Meeting.

Ms. Addy Matney made a motion to recommend approval of Safety Plan as presented by staff. Mr. Darren Scott seconded the motion. There is no opposition. The motion carries.

Discussion Item: United Ministry Employer Data (Presentation by Stephen Shelato, Employment Coach with United Ministries): Three quarters of the people United Ministries works with do not have a car, so employment search becomes a conversation about transportation. He sought a tool to quickly identify employers that are located near a bus line. He realized about half of Greenville County employers are not on a bus route. Mr. Shelato found that 48% of employers in Greenville County are further than half a mile from a bus stop. Ms. Warren stated that she had discussed this as a marketing tool with Mr. Keel. Mr. Keel stated it's a powerful message and shows how transit is important, because it provides employees access to a small percentage of businesses. It could help to highlight how the additional bus routes in the TDP could expand this reach.

Mr. Darren Scott made a motion to adjourn. Ms. Addy Matney seconded the motion to adjourn. There is no opposition. The motion carries.

Minutes were transcribed by Lorrie Brown and distributed via email on Tuesday, May 26, 2020.